

ISLAM AND THE CHANGING MEANING OF SPIRITUALITAS AND SPIRITUAL IN CONTEMPORARY INDONESIA¹

Ahmad Muttaqin

University of Western Sidney, Australia & Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Abstract

Spiritualitas, an Indonesian term derived from English word's spirituality, and spiritual from English's spiritual, are now commonly used in Indonesian discourses. This paper traces earliest usages of the term spiritualitas and spiritual and then explores their changing meaning in contemporary Indonesia. Unlike in the past, where Indonesian government broadly used the terms to refer indigenous mystical legacies of the Aliran Kepercayaan or Kebatinan designing them as not religion but merely cultural legacy (adat, budaya spiritual), the current usage of the terms indicates a growing trend of Indonesian world religions, mainly Islam, in absorbing and acquiring the terms as kind of religious expressions. This trend is quite different from that happen in the West; while the growing of spirituality is correlated to the declining of Western affiliation and participation in religion, mainly Christianity; in Indonesia, world religions, especially Islam, seem to be the sponsor of spirituality. Thus, instead of spirituality will silently take over religion as predicted by Jeremy Carrette and Richard King (2005), the mainstream religious groups seem to take over spirituality.

[Istilah spiritual dan spiritualitas akhir-akhir ini banyak digunakan di Indonesia, merujuk tidak hanya pada ekspresi spiritual di luar agama,

¹ The author thanks Prof. Julia D. Howell and Prof. Bryan S. Turner for their comments on the early manuscript of the paper.

namun juga yang ada dalam tradisi keagamaan. Tulisan ini menelaah awal mula penggunaan istilah spiritual dan spiritualitas dalam khazanah literatur pasca kemerdekaan serta fase-fase perubahan makna dari istilah tersebut pada masa-masa sesudahnya. Pada fase awal, pemerintah Indonesia secara massif menggunakan istilah spiritual untuk menunjuk tradisi keberagamaan di luar agama-agama resmi yang berbasis pada mistisisme agama-agama lokal seperti Aliran Kepercayaan dan Kebatinan. Hal ini mengisyaratkan bahwa istilah spiritual tersebut digunakan untuk menekankan bahwa tradisi beragamaan lokal tersebut bukan agama, hanya warisan budaya atau adat istiadat. Namun, kecenderungan baru sejak akhir 1990an hingga saat ini menunjukkan bahwa agama-agama resmi, terutama Islam, secara massif telah menggunakan istilah spiritual maupun spiritualitas sebagai padanan dari ekspresi batin keberagamaan (inner religious expression). Trend semacam ini cukup unik bila dibandingkan dengan yang terjadi di Barat, sebab tumbuh suburnya gerakan spiritual di Barat terjadi pada saat menurunnya tingkat afiliasi publik terhadap agama-agama besar, terutama Kristen; sedangkan di Indonesia agama-agama besar dunia, terutama Islam, menjadi sponsor utama populernya istilah spiritual dan spiritualitas serta munculnya gerakan-gerakan spiritual berbasis agama. Oleh karena itu, prediksi Jeremy Carrete dan Richard King yang menyatakan “pengambil alihan peran agama oleh spiritualitas” sebagaimana yang terjadi di dunia Barat, tidak terjadi di Indonesia. Sebaliknya, yang terjadi di Indonesia adalah agama-agama besar dunia telah mengambil alih peran dan fungsi spiritualitas.]

Keywords: *Spiritual, Spiritualitas, Islam*

A. Introduction

The development of spiritual group in Western context is part of response to the aridity of modern culture and dogmatism of religion. Heelas and Woodhead² describes such an opposition by proposing two categories, one is ‘subjective life spirituality’ that gives opportunity of the self to celebrate its autonomy in term of inner spiritual/religious

² Paul Heelas, *The New Age Movement: The Celebration of the Self and the Sacralization of Modernity* (Oxford-Cambridge, Mass., USA: Blackwell, 1996); Paul Heelas & Linda Woodhead, L., *The Spiritual Revolution: Why Religion is Giving Way to Spirituality* (Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Pub., 2005).

expression and the other is 'life-as religion' that put one's religiosity in accordance to certain religious tradition. The opposition between religion and spirituality is by nature a result of social process, by which modernity is among the leading causes where spirituality seems to be more demanding rather than religion. The high demand of spiritual marketplace in the Western context even stimulated some scholars to predict the "taking over" of religion by spirituality.³

Like in the West, Indonesia also faces opposition between spiritual and religious expression. In the early used, the term *spiritualitas* (spirituality) was denoted to group that categorized outside religion, but recently it was commonly adopted by religious groups to express inner dimension of religion that was known as either mysticism or just religious teaching in general. Interestingly, the word is now gain popularity in public and is frequently stucked to things that are correlated to secular aspects, such as business, education, carrier, and health. A number of spiritual centres are promoting their spiritual services by charging certain amount of Indonesian Rupiah to those want to gain spiritual efficacies.

This paper traces earliest usage of the words *spiritual* and *spiritualitas* and their changing meaning in contemporary Indonesia as reflected in Indonesian publications and in actual usage of spiritual practitioners. The discussion of this paper is based on my bibliographical studies and findings from fieldwork in Yogyakarta for my PhD dissertation. Before exploring further detail on the issue, I describe historical transformation of Indonesian spiritual groups ranging from one that considered as "Old Legacies to the New Trend," suggesting the dynamic and activity of the groups in preserving and producing spiritual ideas. Due to the higher degree absorption of Indonesian world religions, mainly Islam, to spiritual words and ideas as shown in their reglossing of spiritual activisms, I would argue that, in Indonesian context, religions have even taken over spirituality, instead otherwise as that noted by Carrette and King.

B. *Agama, Kebatinan, and New Spiritual Movements: Historical Overview*

The policy of official religion implemented by the Indonesian

³ Jeremy Carrette & Richard King, *Selling Spirituality, the Silent Takeover of Religion* (London-New York: Routledge, 2005).

government, whereby all citizens must declare their affiliation to one of six recognized religions (Islam, Catholicism, Protestantism, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism) has restricted the development of marginal religious groups. Therefore, the practitioners of marginal religious groups, such as the Javanese mystical tradition of the *kebatinan* movement, have been in a problematic position not only in their relationship with the state, but also with the official religions.

As the expression of marginal religion outside official religion, *kebatinan* groups have been politically and culturally debated during the Old and New Order eras. The political debate on the *kebatinan* can be traced back to the status of Javanese mystical movements as a religious identity among Javanese people since national independence.⁴ However, culturally, the religious ideas and identities of *kebatinan* were actually far more deeply rooted in the legacy of, to borrow Ricklefs words, the “mystic synthesis” which is “the fruit of many years of conflict and accommodation (between Islam and pre-Islamic spiritual conceptions of indigenous Javanese traditions, Hinduism and Buddhism), and never constituted a formal or established orthodoxy that courts were able, or concerned, to enforce.”⁵

Many terms are used to describe this Javanese mystical tradition, such as *kejawen* (Javanism), *kejawaan* (from the word *jawa*, a Sankrit word meaning ‘soul’), *kerobanian* (from the Arabic root *ruh* meaning ‘spirit’), *kawruh kasunyatan* (knowledge of truth), *kebatinan* (from an Arabic word *batin* meaning ‘inner spiritual sense of human life’, as opposed to *labir*

⁴ Paul D. Stange, “‘Legitimate’ Mysticism in Indonesia,” *Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs*, 2 (Summer), 1986, p. 85.

⁵ According to Ricklefs, the mystic synthesis is characterised by a “strong sense of Islamic identity” and “fulfilment of five pillars of Islamic rituals” but accommodates “an array of local spiritual forces”. See M. C. Ricklefs, *Polarizing Javanese Society: Islamic, and Other Visions, 1830-1930* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2007), pp. 5-7. The synthesis, which is a result of the long Islamization process in Java, allows Javanese to accept the outer identity of being Muslim, but still retain their pre-Islamic “inner spiritual conception.” M. C. Ricklefs, *Mystic Synthesis in Java: A History of Islamization from the Fourteenth to the early Nineteenth Centuries* (Nortwalk: Signature Books, 2006), p. 224. However, as Ricklefs has also noted, the mystic synthesis, which was achieved in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, rested on fragile compromises, and was therefore easily challenged in the modern circumstances of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. M. C. Ricklefs, *Mystic Synthesis in Java*, pp. 233-4.

or ‘outer dimension’), and *aliran kepercayaan* (literally meaning ‘stream of belief’). Each of these terms may have a specific meaning depending on its context, and certain groups prefer using one rather than another, giving a specific focus.⁶ Whichever term is used, Stange notes that they all refer to the Javanese “mystical” movements which “emphasize experiential realization of the Absolute within the individual.” However, they tended not to be associated with *klenik*, black magic and other occult practices. The movements nonetheless differed in their manifestations. Some were recorded as accommodating thousands of members implementing organizational principles, while some were identified as “small, local and ephemeral” groups. Many were “purely informal meetings of friends” and some even represent “study club [rather] than [a] context for mystical practice.”⁷

The debate on *kebatinan* was heated during the Old Order and the first half of the New Order era, between the 1950s and 1970s, prompting a number of scholars to study this officially marginal religious movement, e.g. Hadiwiyono (1967),⁸ Hamka (1971),⁹ Rasjidi (1974),¹⁰ Mulder (1978),¹¹ Howe (1980),¹² Stange (1986),¹³ and Howell (1976, 1982, 1998).¹⁴ Some groups sought state recognition for their particular form of *kebatinan* as a religion, that would have, they hoped, the same status and state financial resources already enjoyed by the existing official religions.

Indigenous mystical expressions were disqualified from the

⁶ Paul D. Stange, “Legitimate” Mysticism in Indonesia, p. 87.

⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 85-7.

⁸ Harun Hadiwiyono, *Man in the Present Javanese Mysticism* (Baarn, Netherlands: Bosch & Keuning, 1967).

⁹ Hamka, *Perkembangan Kebatinan di Indonesia* (Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1971).

¹⁰ M. Rasjidi, *Islam dan Kebatinan* (Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1974).

¹¹ Niel Mulder, *Mysticism & Everyday Life in Contemporary Java: Cultural Persistence and Change* (Singapore: Singapore Universities Press, 1978).

¹² D. G. Howe, “Sumarah: A study of the art of living,” *PhD Thesis*, University Microfilms International, University of North Carolina, 1980.

¹³ Paul D. Stange, ““Legitimate” Mysticism in Indonesia”.

¹⁴ Julia D. Howell, “Vehicles for the Kalki Avatar: The Experiments of a Javanese Guru in Rationalizing Ecstatic Religion,” *PhD dissertation*, Stanford University, 1976; Julia D. Howell, “Indonesia: Searching for Concensus,” in C. Cardarola (ed.), *Religion and Societies: Asia and the Middle East* (Berlin: Mouton Publisher, 1982); Julia D. Howell, “Kebatinan,” in J. J. Fox (ed.), *Indonesian Heritage: Religion and Ritual* (Singapore: Archipelago Press, 1988).

definition of the Indonesian official religions (especially Islam and Christianity). The government even continued implementing the Dutch policy of control over the *kebatinan* movement, which in the past had frequently led to political riots. In 1954 the Indonesian government set up the Pengawas Aliran Kepercayaan Masyarakat/PAKEM (the Controlling Body of the Mystical Movement of the Society) to control its development, under the auspices of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. All mystical groups were urged to register with this superintending institution. In 1960, the PAKEM was moved from the Ministry of Religion to the Justice Department, indicating a further deterioration of the position and status of the mystical movement. Under the auspices of the Justice Department, PAKEM tended to treat the movement as potentially subversive and immoral, instead of as a religious expression, as defined by the Ministry of Religion.¹⁵

For the supporters of the movement, the argument for gaining independent status for *kebatinan* as a religion was the 1945 Indonesia Constitution part XI, article 29 which stated: (1) The nation is based on faith in monotheism (*Negara berdasar atas Ketuhanan yang Maha Esa*); (2) The nation guarantees each citizen the freedom to choose his/her own religion and to pray according to his/her own religion or faith (*Negara menjamin kemerdekaan tiap-tiap penduduk untuk memeluk agamanya masing-masing dan untuk beribadat menurut agamanya dan kepercayaannya itu*). The notion of the terms ‘*kepercayaan*’ (faith) and ‘*agama*’ (religion) in the second paragraph provided legitimatization for proponents of the movement to accommodate the group in an organizational body supported by the government. It is worth noting here that the inclusion of the term *kepercayaan*, in the second paragraph of article 29, was an initiative of Wongsonegoro (1897-1978)¹⁶ who objected to the first draft, which did not include it. In fact, as argued by Wongsonegoro, *kebatinan* was guaranteed by the state during the discussion session of the constitution.¹⁷ Wongsonegoro was credited by Stange as “the father

¹⁵ Howell, “Indonesia: Searching for Concensus,” p. 532-3.

¹⁶ Wongsonegoro was a member of the committee for the preparation for the Independence of Indonesia (BPUPKI-Badan Penyelidik Usaha Persiapan Kemerdekaan Indonesia), as a representative of Surakarta region. He was also the Minister for Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia from 1951 to 1952.

¹⁷ Paul D. Stange, “‘Legitimate’ Mysticism in Indonesia,” p. 88.

of the political mystical movement during the fifties” and “the leading national spokesperson for *kebatinan*.” In 1955 Wongsonegoro founded an umbrella organization of *kebatinan* groups, the Badan Kongres Kebatinan Indonesia/BKKI (Congress Board of Indonesian Mysticism) which actively organized seminars and congresses of *kebatinan* activists to broadcast their views worldwide, thus making *kebatinan* the most popular name of the movement during the 1950s to 1960s.¹⁸

Since 1970, *kebatinan* has gained more political support, with Golkar, the ruling party of the New Order era, sponsoring the establishment the Badan Kongres Kepercayaan Kejiwaan Kerohanian Kebatinan Indonesia/BK5I (the Congress Body for Indonesian Faith, Parapsychology, Spirituality, and Mysticism) as a working group of the movement. At the end of 1970, the BK5I transformed to become the Sekretariat Kerjasama Kepercayaan/SKK (the Secretariat of Faith Cooperation), and by 1979 the SKK changed its name to the Himpunan Penghayat Kepercayaan/HPK (Association of Faith Practitioners).¹⁹

In 1973, as stated in the Broad Outlines of State Policy (Garis-garis Besar Haluan Negara/GBHN), the New Order government finally explicitly recognized *kebatinan* as an independent and legitimate expression of faith under the terms of Pancasila, which was based on the Legislative Act of the *Ketetapan MPR RI No. IV/MPR/1973*.²⁰ However, five years later, after a long debate as to whether the groups should be recognized as religious or as cultural expressions, the Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat (Council for Consultative People, House of Assembly) through another Legislative Act, the *Ketetapan MPR No II/MPR/1978*, and reinforced by the *Ketetapan MPR No IV/MPR/1978*, classified *kebatinan* groups as merely part of *adat*, indigenous expression of Indonesian spiritual belief (*kepercayaan*) in the One High God (*Ketuhanan yang Maha Esa*), not as an independent religious expression.

The above Legislative Acts basically reinforced state policy whereby, since the 1970s, the Indonesian government officially classified the movement as ‘*Aliran Kepercayaan*’ (stream of belief), administrated by the Direktorat Pembinaan Penghayat Kepercayaan (Directorate for

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 87-9.

¹⁹ Howell, “Indonesia: Searching for Concensus,” p. 833-4; Paul D. Stange, “‘Legitimate’ Mysticism in Indonesia,” pp. 90-1.

²⁰ Paul D. Stange, “‘Legitimate’ Mysticism in Indonesia,” p. 90.

Educating Mystical Practitioners) under the auspices of the Department of Education and Culture, instead of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Although this classification did not give *kebatinan* equal status with official religions, at least it had been granted, by the 1945 constitution, recognition as a legitimate expression of faith.²¹

In addition to the struggle for political recognition of *kebatinan*, efforts were made to gain, for *kebatinan* groups, equal recognition with the independent religious groups on the cultural level. Subagya reported that between 1952 and 1972 there were more than 30 *kebatinan* groups explicitly using the term ‘*agama*’ (religion) in their names, such as Agama Adam Marifat, Agama Suci Akhir Jaman, and Agama Jawa Sunda,²² reflecting that they actually considered themselves to be independent religions.²³

In this regard, the relationship between the groups and the official religions was problematic. The relationship was occasionally made worse when some of the official religious groups became suspicious, and continually accused *kebatinan* groups of having insulted other religions.²⁴ Muslim scholars such as Hamka²⁵ and Rasjidi²⁶ tended to see the *kebatinan* movement from historical and Islamic theological perspectives, regarding its development as having been caused by too weak an understanding of true Islam among Javanese people, leading them to express a syncretized

²¹ Julia D. Howell, “‘Spirituality’ vs. ‘Religion’ Indonesian Style: Framing and Re-framing Experiential Religiosity in Contemporary Indonesian Islam,” Paper presented at the the 15th Biennial Conference of the Asian Studies Association of Australia, Canberra, ACT. <http://coombs.anu.edu.au/SpecialProj/ASAA/biennial-conference/2004/Howell-J-ASAA2004.pdf>.

²² Rachmat Subagya, *Kepercayaan Kebatinan Kerohanian Kejivaaan dan Agama* (Yogyakarta: Yayasan Kanisius, 1976), pp. 130-1.

²³ Howell, ‘Spirituality’ vs. ‘Religion’ Indonesian Style, p. 3.

²⁴ Rahmat Subagya, *Agama Asli Indonesia* (Jakarta: Sinar Harapan, 1981), pp. 269-70. While some groups were eager to gain the independent and autonomous status of a recognized religious group, many senior *kebatinan* figures, as recorded by Subagya, frequently asserted that *kebatinan* was neither a new religion nor in opposition to world religions. Despite Subagya denoting *kebatinan* as the regeneration of the Indonesian ‘*agama asli*’ (indigenous religion), most *kebatinan* practitioners, especially after the New Order fully implemented the politics of official religions, asserted that world religions were not their enemies and declared themselves as merely cultural-mystical groups.

²⁵ See Hamka, *Perkembangan Kebatinan di Indonesia*.

²⁶ See Rasjidi, *Islam dan Kebatinan*.

form of Islam. Simuh, who studied the Javanese mystical text of the *Suluk Hidayat Jati* of Ronggowarsito, regarded *kebatinan* groups as being directly or indirectly a 'deviation' from Islam (*gerakan sempalan bagi agama Islam*). Simuh even asserted that the relationship between *kebatinan* groups and Islam was like that between "anak nakal dengan ibunya" (brats and their moms). Sometimes the relationships were fraught, as in the story of Siti Jenar, *Serat Darmagandbul*, *Gatholoco*, or there was tension, such as in the *Wedhatama*, and sometimes the relationships were mutually understanding, as in the *Wulangreh*, *Wirid Hidayat Jati*, *Suluk Sukma Lelana*, *Serat Paramayoga*, and *Centhini*.²⁷

This less sympathetic view of *kebatinan*, among Indonesian Muslim scholars, differs slightly from that of some Western scholars who studied the movement. Although some researchers, like Hadiwiyono and Stange, saw *kebatinan* as a conveyor of sophisticated Hindu and Islamic Sufi metaphysics, integrated with images from the local spirit world, the essence of Islam is still dominant. After studying spiritual practices and tenets of the major *kebatinan* groups in Solo and Yogyakarta, Stange even noted that *kebatinan* is evidence of the successful integration of Islamization into Javanese spiritual life, saying: "When we approach Islam as a mode of discourse and inner orientation, rather than in strictly doctrinal and ritual terms, it becomes evident that the Islamization of Java has reached farther into the recesses of Javanese spiritual life than we would otherwise suspect."²⁸

During the New Order era, *kebatinan* had been a political asset to the regime. The huge number of *kebatinan* followers had motivated the ruling party of the New Order era, Golkar, to protect it. It seemed there was a mutual relationship between the movement and the party -the ruling party politically protected the movement, and the party, in turn, received support from the *kebatinan* members. It was recorded that Soeharto's religiosity, mainly in his early presidency, was closer to

²⁷ Simuh, "Gerakan Protes dalam Islam di Indonesia," *Paper* presented at the Panel Diskusi Analisis Kristis Berkembangnya Gerakan Sempalan di Kalangan Umat Islam Indonesia, Jakarta, 1989, p. 24. It should be noted here, that although *kebatinan* was frequently thought of as a deviation from, or at least a heterodox practice of, Islam, it did not mean that the *kebatinan*'s theology was less sophisticated.

²⁸ See Hadiwiyono, *Man in the Present Javanese Mysticism*; Stange, "'Legitimate" Mysticism in Indonesia," p. 107.

kebatinan than to orthodox Islam.²⁹ The government even sponsored weekly national television programs on *aliran kepercayaan* teaching, as it did for other world religions.

The fall of Soeharto in 1998 puts into an end the privileges enjoyed by *kebatinan* groups during the New Order. The groups then seem to have been re-marginalized, lost their impetus and faced further challenges in their problematic position. Among governmental reforms during the reformation era, the Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan/Depdikbud (Department of Education and Culture) was first renamed the Department of National Education and then the Ministry of National Education. The removal of cultural duties from the Department and Ministry of National Education placed *kebatinan* under the administration of the Kementerian Pariwisata dan Kebudayaan (Ministry of Tourism, Arts and Culture), and marked a further 'put down' of *kebatinan*, trivializing the group as just an old fashioned curiosity.³⁰

Although *kebatinan* groups have lost their 'political patron', especially after the fall of Soeharto, criticism of the groups continues. For example, Artawijaya regarded the movement as not purely Indonesian home-grown spirituality, but as linked to the development of the Theosophy movement in early twentieth century Indonesia. Many Indonesian figures, mainly Javanese aristocrats (*prijayi*), had been involved in the movement.³¹ Applying a conspiracy theory, Artawijaya further notes

²⁹ M.C. Ricklef, *A History of Modern Indonesia Since c. 1200* (Hampshire: Palgrave, 2001), p. 356.

³⁰ It should be noted here that in 2011 the Ministry of National Education (MNE) was renamed to the Ministry of National and Culture (MNC). The rearrangement of Cultural affairs from the Ministry of Tourism into the MNC emerged a new hope of government cultural support for *kebatinan* practitioners as well as any other local cultures. Nevertheless, the hope has been suddenly gone when the vice ministry of the MNC for cultural affairs is one whose background was architecture instead of social sciences. Many of cultural groups are disappointed because the government policy of culture would be based on hard culture not the soft one.

³¹ Researchers on the theosophy movement in Indonesia reported that Javanese *prijayi* were among *Bumi Putera* who were enthusiastically involved in the group. Tollenaere noted, "Indonesian FTS (Fellow of Theosophical Society) mainly came from Javanese princely families and others from the *prijayi* classes." He listed Javanese aristocratic figures like Raden Mas Aryo Wuryaningrat of Surakarta, Raden Mas T. Sarwoko Mangunkoesoemo, the *patih* (prime minister) of Prince Mangkoe Negoro VII, Pakoe Boewono XI, and Paku Alam VII of Pakualaman Duke Yogyakarta. See Herman

that the Theosophy movement was in fact part of a Jewish project to devastate Islam in Indonesia. Comparing the *kebatinan* teachings and the Theosophy doctrines, he underlines their mutual relationship. He also notes that *kebatinan* groups grew massively in cities where Theosophy was developed.³²

The conspiracy point of view, however, tends to overgeneralize, drawing a conclusion based on thin evidence. For example, Annie Besant, the Theosophy leader who visited Java in the colonial era of the early 1900s, was a member of Co-Freemasonry,³³ a form of Freemasonry that admits both male and female members. Because there is a common view among Indonesian people that Freemasonry is supported by Jews, everything related to Theosophy is considered as part of a Jewish project in Indonesia. Furthermore, portraying the involvement of some royal courts of Javanese *priyayi* in the Theosophy society as an indication that the *kebatinan* movement was a Jewish project is simplistic. In fact, the founders of four nationally prominent *kebatinan* groups studied by Stange-Pangetu, Saptadharma, Subud and Sumarah- were “commoner people whose social origins were the lower states of the *priyayi* with a distant connection with the royal court”³⁴ and had no record of interaction with the Theosophy movement in their spiritual quests.

A. O. de Tollenaere, *The Politics of Divine Wisdom: Theosophy and Labour, National, and Women's Movements in Indonesia and South Asia 1875-1947* (Leiden: Uitgeverij Katholieke Universiteit Nijmegen: 1996), pp. 115–7. See also Iskandar P. Nugraha, *Mengikis Batas Timur dan Barat: Gerakan Theosofi & Nasionalisme Indonesia* (Jakarta: Komunitas Bambu, 2001) pp. 49–51.

³² Artawijaya, *Gerakan Theosofi di Indonesia: Menelusuri Jejak Kebatinan Yabudi Sejak Masa Hindia Belanda Hingga Era Reformasi* (Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar, 2010), p. 236–65. The notion about the influence of Theosophy Movement and Freemasonry on *kebatinan* has been also considered by scholars such as Bruinessen, but he does not regard it as proof of a Jewish project in the country. See Martin van Bruinessen, “Saint, Politician and Sufi Bureaucrats: Mysticism and Politics in Indonesian’s New Order,” in Martin van Bruinessen & Julia D. Howell (eds), *Sufism and the ‘Modern’ in Islam* (New York: I.B. Tauris, 2007), p. 97.

³³ The biography of Annie Besant notes that in 1902, Annie introduced International Co-Freemasonry into England before she was elected as president of the Theosophical Society in 1907. See Grand Lodge of British and Yukon (2002), *Annie Wood Besant*; http://freemasonry.bcy.ca/biography/esoterica/besant_a/besant_a.html; retrieved 5 December, 2011.

³⁴ Paul D. Stange, “‘Legitimate’ Mysticism in Indonesia,” p. 101.

Although government policy on religion has restricted the development of the spiritual tradition of the *kebatinan* movement, especially since the reformation era, thirst for spirituality continues to increase among urban people. In the last two decades, with the ease of global communication and transportation, the new middle class Indonesians have started to search for their spiritual channel in the global spiritual market place. A number of promotions of spirituality have developed in urban Indonesia by various paths, ranging from executive Sufi study groups (KKA Paramadina, ICNIS, IIMaN, Tazkiyah Sejati), popular televangelism promoting Sufi elements (Aa Gym and Arifin Ilham), and *majlis dhiker* groups, to leadership training centres exposing spiritual intelligences (*kecerdasan spiritual*, ESQ) of Ary Ginanjar.³⁵ These provide a new spirituality associated with Sufism, known as *Sufi Perkotaan* (Urban Sufism). There are also groups promoting a spirituality which resembles that of global spiritual groups operating in Indonesia, such as Falun Gong, Reiki, and Brahma Kumaris. Other groups represent home-grown eclectic spirituality, such as Anand Krishna's Anand Ashram and One Earth One Sky of Gede Prama.³⁶

These kind of new spiritual groups, that began to emerge in the 1990s within official religions, mainly Islam, mostly focuses on spiritual expression as part of piety-promotion projects, by exploring

³⁵ See J.B. Hoesterey, "Sufis and Self-help Gurus: Islamic Psychology, Religious Authority, and Muslim Subjectivity in Contemporary Indonesia," *PhD dissertation*, The University of Wisconsin, Wisconsin, 2009; Julia D. Howell, "Sufism and the Indonesian Islamic Revival," *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 60 (3), August 2001, pp. 701–29; Howell, "Spirituality' vs. 'Religion' Indonesian Style; Julia D. Howell, "The New Spiritualities, East and West: Colonial Legacies and the Global Spiritual Marketplace in Southeast Asia," *ASSR*, 19(1), 2006, pp. 19-33; and Julia D. Howell "Modernity and Islamic Spirituality in Indonesia's New Sufi Networks," in M. van Bruinessen & J. D. Howell (eds), *Sufism and the 'Modern' in Islam*; Daromir Rudnyckyj, "Market Islam in Indonesia," *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* (NS), 2009a, pp. 183-201; Arif Zamhari, *Rituals of Islamic Spirituality: A Study of Majlis Dhiker Groups in East Java* (Canberra: ANU-Press, 2010).

³⁶ In urban Indonesia there are three types of contemporary spiritual providers, as classified by Howell: (1) international organisations operating in Indonesia, such as Brahma Kumaris, The Art of Living, Falun Gong and Reiki; (2) home-grown eclectic groups like Anand Krishna's Anand Ashram and One Earth One Sky of Gede Prama; (3) universalist Sufi groups, such as Yayasan/Padepokan Thoha of K. H. Rahmat Hidayat, Pusaka Hati's Kabir Sufism and Bishara. See Howell, 'Spirituality' vs. 'Religion' Indonesian Style.

Sufism teachings at a practical level. In this context, Sufi teachings are combined with self-management and humanistic psychology as a self-improvement and employee development program. The exploration of Sufi teaching on television programs since 2000, such as Aa Gym's *Indahnya Kebersamaan* (the beauty of togetherness) and *Manajemen Qolbu* (management of the heart), *Zikir Akbar* (the Great *Dzikir*) of Arifin Ilham,³⁷ and Yusuf Mansur's *Wisata Hati* (tour of the heart), has led to the subtle commercialization of Islamic spirituality. In such popular Sufi television shows, the preachers were paid through their contracts with the television studios, which, in turn, gained financial benefit from the sponsors of the programs. The preachers also engaged in exclusive cross selling of their products, such as CDs, books, and private training seminars.

The explorations of Sufi teachings become overtly commercialized when they are converted into programs for self-development. Aa Gym has developed one of the most popular of these. He created 'spiritual' management training courses, known as MQ or *Manajemen Qalbu* (Management of the Heart),³⁸ following his project of *Bengkel Akhlaq* (workshop on morality) in his pesantren.³⁹ Hoesterey notes that the "*Manajemen Qalbu* was a psycho-religious self-improvement program to help Indonesian Muslims implement Islamic teaching in order to achieve worldly riches and heavenly salvation."⁴⁰ Another notable figure is Ary Ginanjar Agustian, who developed a program called the ESQ (Emotional Spiritual Quotient) Way 165. Since 2000, Ginanjar has

³⁷ Julia D. Howell, "Indonesia's Salafis Sufi," *Modern Asia Studies*, 44, 2010, pp. 1029-51.

³⁸ See J. B. Hoesterey, "Marketing Morality: the Rise, Fall and Rebranding of Aa Gym," in G. Fealy & S. White (eds), *Expressing Islam: Religious Life and Politics in Indonesia* (Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2008); Hoesterey, *Sufis and Self-help Gurus*; Julia D. Howell, "Modulations of Active Piety: Professors and Televangelists as Promoters of Indonesian "Sufisme,"" in Grek Fealy & Selly White (eds), *Expressing Islam Religious Life and Politics in Indonesia* (Singapore: ISEAS, 2008); and Zaki Nur'aeni, "The Phenomenon of Abdullah Gymnastiar and Darut Tauhid: A Notion of Pietization," *Paper* presented at the Graduate Workshop on Piety and Pietization in Asia, Singapore, 2007.

³⁹ D. Solahudin, *The Workshop for Morality: The Islamic Creativity of Pesantren Darut Tauhid in Bandung, Java* (Canberra: ANU E-Press, 2008).

⁴⁰ Hoesterey, *Sufis and Self-help Gurus*, p. 263-4.

introduced the ESQ training program, following his best-selling book on this subject. The ESQ is claimed to be an integrated and sustainable method of spiritual engineering for nurturing strength of character that will increase human productivity and help people achieve meaningful lives.⁴¹ Rudnyckyj describes the spiritual program of the ESQ Way 165 as “Spiritual Economies,”⁴² a bridge for upper middle class Indonesians, between Islamic ethics and neo-liberal economies. The ESQ, Rudnyckyj further argues, has led to the development of one kind of “Market Islam” in Indonesia.⁴³

According to Howell, the growth of new spiritual expression in contemporary Indonesia is in parallel with Western spirituality, and she notes that new middle class Indonesian Muslims are Western spiritual consumers.⁴⁴ To support her argument, Howell explores a term she calls the “new spirituality,” referring to a “form of ‘inward’ religiosity” or inner dimension religion “(1) that prioritises subjective perception of the sacred, (2) that arises in the society that has been drawn into industrial and post industrial patterns of social changes, and (3) that are discontinuous with the syncretised and magical underlay beneath rationalised, universalistic religions in those societies.”⁴⁵

Another newly emergent type of spiritual group in contemporary Indonesia comprises ‘businesses’ that sell spiritual efficacy, not just through training programs but also through material objects promoted as being spiritually powerful. Unlike the spiritual piety groups that aim for the achievement of worldly success and material benefits by character building through nurturing piety (as in the spiritual programs of Aa Gym, Arifin Ilham, and the ESQ of Ary Ginanjar), the spiritual efficacy groups tend to promote ‘practical’ spiritual efficacy. In their commodification of spiritual efficacy, these groups develop and package practical programs

⁴¹ ESQ LC, *About Us, Your Partner in Character Building*; <http://www.esqway165.com/id/about-us/>; retrieved 10 September, 2011.

⁴² Daromir Rudnyckyj, “Spiritual Economies: Islam dan Neoliberalism in Contemporary Indonesia,” *Cultural Anthropology*, 24(1) 2009, pp. 104-41.

⁴³ D. Rudnyckyj, “Market Islam in Indonesia,” *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* (NS), 2009, pp. 183-201.

⁴⁴ Howell, “The New Spiritualities, East and West,” p. 19-33; and Howell, “Modernity and Islamic Spirituality”.

⁴⁵ Howell, “The New Spiritualities, East and West,” p. 1.

and material products which, to some extents, are framed as ‘instantly’ efficacious in helping ordinary people to grasp the fruits of modernity, regardless of character or spiritual purity. The spiritual efficacy thus promoted, such as prosperity, health, and worldly success, interestingly, can be achieved not only by participating in the groups’ spiritual programs but also by consuming or using their spiritual objects. Such ‘instant’ efficacy marks the groups as different from, for example, Reiki and Falun Gong, which offer better health through a long process of gentle spiritual exercises and meditation.

The spiritual efficacy groups are similar to piety groups in terms of borrowing and combining spiritual techniques from both local and global origins. But, instead of just targeting the global spiritual markets arising as a consequence of modernization and globalization, the spiritual efficacy groups prefer to promote their local spiritual legacies with the aim of finding a niche in the international spiritual marketplace for themselves. Further, while the piety groups, such as exponents of ‘Urban Sufism’, are highly concerned with purity and avoid any heterodox Islamic traditions, the spiritual efficacy groups tend to explore the heterodox and even practices associated with occultism, and then frame them with contemporary spiritual notions and scientific justification.

C. The Changing Meaning of *Spiritual* and *Spiritualitas* in Contemporary Indonesia: the Taking Over of Spirituality by Religion

The words *spiritualitas*, an Indonesian term derived from the English noun ‘spirituality’, and ‘*spiritual*’ from the English adjective ‘spiritual’, are now commonly used in Indonesian. The terms appear more and more frequently, in Indonesian literature, in newspapers, magazines, periodicals, and books. According to the *Kamus Bahasa Indonesia* (the Dictionary of Bahasa Indonesia), ‘*spiritual*’ means “*berhubungan dengan atau bersifat kejiwaan (rohani, batin)*” (something associated with the psychiatric, *spiritual*, *mental* or ‘inner’ life). The dictionary also lists two nouns related to ‘*spiritual*’, namely ‘*spiritualisasi*’ and ‘*spiritualisme*’. The first refers to a formation of the soul and inspiration (*pembentukan jiwa and penjinaan*), whereas the latter denotes: (1) a school of philosophy that prioritizes spirituality (*aliran filsafat yang mengutamakan kerohanian*), (2) a belief system for summoning

the spirits of people who have died (*kepercayaan untuk memanggil roh orang yang sudah meninggal*), and (3) *spiritisme* that, according to the dictionary, means: (1) worship of spirits, (2) a belief that spirits can communicate with living humans, and (3) teaching on ways to summon spirits (*pemujaan kepada roh; kepercayaan bahwa roh dapat berhubungan dengan manusia yg masih hidup; ajaran dan cara-cara memanggil roh*).⁴⁶

None of the above meanings of the word ‘*spiritual*’ nor of the other three related words, ‘*spiritualisasi*’, ‘*spiritualisme*’, and ‘*spiritisme*’, are explicitly associated with religious teachings in terms of the traditions of world religions, or of official religions in the Indonesian context. Most of the meanings refer to belief systems and practices that are anthropologically associated with animism, whose practices tend to be condemned by world religions, especially by the puritan groups. The meaning of ‘*spiritual*’ in the dictionary is a little bit different from the meaning given in *Webster’s English Dictionary*. The latter defines ‘*spiritual*’ more broadly, ranging from meanings concerned with religion (mainly the Christian tradition) to soul, to phantom.⁴⁷ *Webster English Dictionary* also defines ‘*spirituality*’ in a broader context that includes something (i.e. property, income, body) related to church: “things of the spirit, the quality of being spiritual belonging to the church, an ecclesiastic person, or religion, or a whole ecclesiastical body.”⁴⁸ *The Kamus Bahasa Indonesia* does not cover any meaning of ‘*spiritualitas*’, although the word is now in common public use.

⁴⁶ Tim Penyusun Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia, *Kamus Bahasa Indonesia* (Jakarta: Pusat Bahasa, 2008), p. 1373.

⁴⁷ The meanings of ‘*spiritual*’ in *Webster’s Online Dictionary* are, among others: “concerned with sacred matters or religion or the church; concerned with or affecting the spirit or soul; lacking material body or form or substance; resembling or characteristic of a phantom”; *Webster’s Online Dictionary*; <http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/definitions/Spiritual?cx=partner-pub-0939450753529744%3Av0qd01-tdlq&cof=FORID%3A9&ie=UTF-8&q=Spiritual&sa=Search#922>; retrieved 15 May, 2011.

⁴⁸ The meanings of ‘*spirituality*’ according to *Webster’s Online Dictionary* are: “1. Property or income owned by a church; 2. Concern with things of the spirit; 3. The quality or state of being spiritual; incorporeality; heavenly-mindedness; 4. That which belongs to the church, or to a person as an ecclesiastic, or to religion, as distinct from temporalities; 5. An ecclesiastical body; the whole body of the clergy, as distinct from, or opposed to, the temporality.”

The increasing availability of literatures on Sufism and spirituality in Indonesia, even those are connected to international publications, has been detected since the 1970s.⁴⁹ Among Indonesian publications, Osman Raliby's *Islam dan Kehidupan: Mental, Spiritual, Material* (Islam and Life: Mental, Spiritual, Material) (1975) is considered the earliest Indonesian book using the term '*spiritual*' in its title, while the first magazine explicitly declared as a *spiritual* periodical was *Mawas Diri* (literally meaning 'introspective'), first published in 1972. The magazine was initiated and led by S. K. Trimurti, a journalist and national liberation fighter for pre-Independent Indonesia, and one of the *kebatinan* proponents during the New Order era.⁵⁰ Beneath the title of the *Mawas Diri*, there was a note in the old version of bahasa Indonesia saying: "*Majalah bulanan jang bersifat mental spiritual, mengarah kepada sila Ketuhanan Jang Maha Esa. Berisi: masalah dan analisa kedjinaan, dipandang dari sudut: ilmiah, filsafat, pschologi, keagamaan dan aliran-aliran kepertjajaan* (a spiritual monthly magazine in accordance with belief in monotheistic principles, that covers issues and analyses of spirituality as seen from perspectives of science, philosophy, psychology, religion and Javanese mysticism)." Due to the high cost of production, and competition within the publication industry, the magazine ceased publication in 1999.

During the 1980s and early 1990s, the word '*spiritual*' was commonly used by government publications, mainly of the Depdikbud, in documentation of, or research reports on, the *Kebatinan/ Aliran Kepercayaan* movements. Examples of such publications are *Pembinaan Organisasi dan Pelestarian Budaya Spiritual* (fostering of organizations and preservation of spiritual culture) (1985),⁵¹ *Pengkajian Nilai-nilai Lubur Budaya Spiritual Bangsa Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta* (assessment of the noble values of spiritual culture of the people of the special region of Yogyakarta) (1990),⁵²

⁴⁹ Howell, "Sufism and the Indonesian Islamic Revival."

⁵⁰ U. Ilyas, "SK Trimurti: Pejuang Pembebasan Nasional" dalam *Berdikari Online*, <http://berdikarionline.com/opini/20100916/sk-trimurti-wartawati-pejuang-pembebasan-nasional.html>; retrieved 16 September 2010.

⁵¹ Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, *Pembinaan Organisasi dan Pelestarian Budaya Spiritual* (Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 1985).

⁵² Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, *Pengkajian Nilai-nilai Lubur Budaya Spiritual Bangsa Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta* (Yogyakarta: Kantor Wilayah Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan DIY, 1990).

Naskah Pemaparan Budaya Spiritual Yayasan Sosrokartono (manuscript of spiritual culture of the Sosrokartono foundation) (1991),⁵³ *Budaya Spiritual dalam Situs Keramat di Gunung Kawi, Jawa Timur* (spiritual culture of sacred sites in Gunung Kawi, East Java) (1994).⁵⁴

It is interesting to note here that the usage of the term ‘*budaya spiritual*,’ in government publications, referring to *Aliran Kepercayaan/Kebatiman* belief and practice, highlighted and underlined the perception that such traditions were not religious. These terms, therefore, illustrate that the *Aliran Kepercayaan* was not a religious tradition, just a cultural expression. Thus, the government used the word ‘*spiritual*’ as a contrast to ‘*religion*’, denoting that spiritual tradition was outside the domain of world religions.⁵⁵

Nevertheless, after early 1994, in addition to those published by the Indonesian government, some Indonesian books began to use ‘*spiritual*’ in their titles. The word was used by Indonesian writers in its broader meaning, not only to refer to the spiritual culture of the *Aliran Kepercayaan* belief and practice, but also to world religious traditions, as in: *Spiritualitas, Pluralitas dan Pembangunan di Indonesia* (Spirituality, Plurality and Development in Indonesia) by Victor I. Tanja (1994),⁵⁶ *Teologi dan Spiritualitas* (Theology and Spirituality) by Tom Jacobs (1994),⁵⁷ *Dialog dengan Jin Muslim: Pengalaman Spiritual* (Dialogue with a Muslim Genie: A Spiritual Experience) by Muhammad Isa Dawud (1995),⁵⁸ *Gerak-gerak Allah: Sejumput Hikmah Spiritual* (The Movement of God: A Pinch of

⁵³ Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, *Naskah Pemaparan Budaya Spiritual Yayasan Sosrokartono* (Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan R.I., 1991).

⁵⁴ Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, *Budaya, Spiritual dalam Situs Keramat di Gunung Kawi, Jawa Timur* (Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan R.I., 1994).

⁵⁵ In addition to governmental publications, there were Islamic and social studies books published in the late 1980s using the word ‘*Spiritualitas*’ as a title, but most of them are translated books, such as *Spiritualitas Islam: Ensiklopedia Tematis* by Seyyed Hossein Nasr (1985), *Spiritualitas dan Seni Islam* by Seyyed Hossein Nasr (1987); and *Visi-visi Postmodern: Spiritualitas dan Masyarakat* by David Ray Griffin (1988) .

⁵⁶ Victor I. Tanja, *Spiritualitas Pluralitas dan Pembangunan Indonesia* (Jakarta: Gunung Mulia, 1994).

⁵⁷ Tom Jacobs, *Teologi dan Spiritualitas* (Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 1994).

⁵⁸ Muhammad Isa Dawud, *Dialog dengan Jin Muslim: Pengalaman Spiritual*, trans. A. Muhammad (Bandung: Pustaka Hidayah, 1995).

the Wisdom of Spirituality) by Danarto (1996),⁵⁹ *Al Qur'an: Mu'jizat, Karomat, Maunat dan Hukum Evolusi Spiritual* (Al Qur'an: Miracle, Karomah, Ma'unah and the Evolutionary Law of Spirituality) by Ace Partadiredja (1997),⁶⁰ and *Kutemukan Tuhan di Balik Penyakit Gagal Ginjal: Otobiografi Spiritual Handjojo Nitimihardjo* (I Found God Behind my Kidney: Spiritual Autobiography of Handjojo Nimitihardjo) by Handjojo Nitimihardjo (1998).⁶¹ Other books used the word '*spiritual*' in the context of occult practices, such as *Penipuan Berkedok Spiritual: Waspadai Trik dan Sihir* (The Fraud of Impersonated Spirituality: Beware of Trick and Magic) by Teguh Prana Jaya (1999),⁶² and *Sukses Profesi Spiritual: Etika Konsultasi yang Berwibawa* (Success of the Spiritual Profession: The Ethic of Charismatic Consultation), by Masruri (1999).⁶³

Since 2000, the words '*spiritual*' and '*spiritualitas*' have been used with more extensive meanings. Numerous Indonesian publications, in various genres ranging from the scientific, to manuals, novels and biographies, use the terms in their titles. The KITLV library in Leiden, the Netherlands, considered as holding one of the most complete collections on Indonesian history, records more than one hundred titles of Indonesian books explicitly using the word '*spiritual*'. Most of them are by Indonesian writers, but with the advance of information technology, allowing people easy access to the global spiritual market, many are translations or adaptations of Western New Age and similar spiritual publications.

The current trend of Indonesian spiritual publications can therefore be classified in four categories. First, books that expound applied spirituality, exploring spirituality for this-worldly prosperity. This includes 'how to' or self-help spiritual development, which is described along the lines of Neuro-Linguistic Programming (NLP). Examples of

⁵⁹ Danarto, *Gerak Gerik Allah: Sejumpt Hikmah Spiritual* (Surabaya: Risalah Gusti, 1996).

⁶⁰ Ace Partadiredja, *Al Qur'an: Mu'jizat, Karomat, Maunat dan Hukum Evolusi Spiritual* (Yogyakarta: Dana Bhakti Prima Yasa, 1997).

⁶¹ Handjojo Nitimihardjo, *Kutemukan Tuhan di Balik Penyakit Gagal Ginjal: Otobiografi Spiritual Handjojo Nitimihardjo* (Jakarta: Pustaka Antara Utama, 1998).

⁶² Teguh Prana Jaya, *Penipuan Berkedok Spiritual: Waspadai Trik dan Sihir* (Solo: Aneka, 1999).

⁶³ Masruri, *Sukses Profesi Spiritual: Etika Konsultasi yang Berwibawa* (Solo: Aneka, 1999).

such publications are *The Power of Spiritual Intelligence: Sepuluh Cara Jadi Orang yang Cerdas Secara Spiritual* (The Power of Spiritual Intelligence: Ten Ways of Being Spiritually Intelligent People) by Tony Buzan (2003),⁶⁴ *There is a Spiritual Solution to Every Problem* by Wayne W. Dyer (2005),⁶⁵ *Spirituality in Business: Pencerahan Hati Bagi Pelaku Usaha* (Heart Enlightenment for the Business Person) by Muhammad Abdul Ghani (2005),⁶⁶ *Spiritual Capital: Memberdayakan SQ di Dunia Bisnis*, by Danah Zohar and Ian Marshal (2005),⁶⁷ *Spirituality@Work: 10 Cara Menyeimbangkan Hidup Anda di Tempat Kerja* (10 Ways for Balancing Your Life in the Work Place) by Gregory F. A. Pierce (2006),⁶⁸ *Spiritual Based Management: Memimpin dan Bekerja Berbasis Spiritual* (Leading and Working Based on Spirituality) by Lukman Hakim and Wikayanto (2007),⁶⁹ *Spiritual Thinking: Sukses dengan Neuro Linguistic Programming (NLP) dan Tasawuf* (Success with Neuro-Linguistic Programming and Sufism) by Priatno H. Martokoesoema (2007),⁷⁰ *The Secret* by Rhonda Byrne (2008),⁷¹ *Membangun Kecerdasan Finansial dengan Nilai-Nilai Spiritualitas* (Developing Financial Intelligence with Spiritual Values) by Eko Pratomo (2008).⁷²

Second, spiritual publications that explore Islamic teaching on a practical level, concerning the psychologization of religion and self-management, as well as contextualization of religious doctrine, such as: *Rabasia Sukses Membangun Kecerdasan Emosi dan Spiritual ESQ (Emotional Spiritual Quotient): Berdasarkan 6 Rukun Iman dan 5 Rukun Islam* (Secret

⁶⁴ Tony Buzan, *The Power of Spiritual Intelligence: Sepuluh Cara Jadi Orang yang Cerdas Secara Spiritual*, trans. A. T. Kanjono & F. Fialita (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2003).

⁶⁵ Wayne W. Dyer, *There is Spiritual Solution to Every Problem* (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2005).

⁶⁶ Muhammad Abdul Ghani, *The Spirituality in Business: Pencerahan Hati Bagi Pelaku Usaha* (Jakarta: Pena Budi Aksara, 2005).

⁶⁷ Donah Zohar, and Ian Marshal, *Spiritual Capital: Memberdayakan SQ di Dunia Bisnis*, trans H. Mustofa (Bandung: Mizan, 2005).

⁶⁸ Gregory F. A. Pierce, *Spirituality@Work: 10 Cara Menyeimbangkan Hidup Anda di Tempat Kerja* (Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 2006).

⁶⁹ Lukman Hakim and Wikayanto, *Spiritual Based Management: Memimpin dan Bekerja Berbasis Spiritual* (Jakarta: Hikmah, 2007).

⁷⁰ Priatno H. Martokoesoema, *Spiritual Thinking: Sukses dengan Neuro Linguistic Programming (NLP) dan Tasawuf* (Bandung: Mizan Pustaka, 2007).

⁷¹ Rhonda Byrne, *The Secret* (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2008).

⁷² Eko Pratomo, *Membangun Kecerdasan Finansial dengan Nilai-nilai Spiritualitas* (Jakarta: Arga Publishing, 2008).

Tips to be Success in the Building of Emotional and Spiritual Quotient: in accordance to 6 Pillars of Islam and 5 Basic Principles of the Religion) by Ary Ginanjar Agustian (2001),⁷³ *Jelajah Diri: Panduan Psikologi Spiritual Membangun Kepribadian* (Exploring the Self: A Guide to Spiritual Psychology for Self Development) by Syaikh Fadhalla Haeri (2004),⁷⁴ *Ramadhan dan Pencerahan Spiritual* (Ramadhan and Spiritual Enlightenment) by Muhammad (2005),⁷⁵ *Online dengan Allah: 24 Jam Membangkitkan Kembali Spiritualitas Anda* (Online with Allah: 24 Hours Reviving your Spirituality) by Teguh Purwadi (2007),⁷⁶ *Mukjizat Shalat Malam: Meraih Spiritualitas Rasulullah* (The Miracle of Night Praying: Grasping the Spirituality of God's Messenger) by Sallamah Muhammad Abu Al-Kamal (2009),⁷⁷ and *Spiritual Quantum Smile: Raih Sukses Dunia Akhirat dengan Senyum Dahsyat Memikat* (Achieving This-Worldly and Hereafter Success with a Powerful and Attractive Smile) by Puji Hartono and Pranowo (2010).⁷⁸

Third, Religious-Spiritual Studies like SQ, *Memfaatkan Kecerdasan Spiritual dalam Berfikir Integralistik dan Holistik untuk Memaknai Kehidupan* (Fruitfully Use Spiritual Quotient in the Frame of Integral and Holistic Model of Thinking for the Sake of Putting Meaning into Life) by Danah Zohar and Ian Marshall (2001),⁷⁹ *Pendidikan Spiritual dalam*

⁷³ Ary Ginanjar Agustian, *Rabasia Sukses Membangun Kecerdasan Emosi dan Spiritual ESQ (Emotional Spiritual Quotient): Berdasarkan 6 Rukun Iman dan 5 Rukun Islam* (Jakarta: Arga, 2001). In 2005, Ginanjar released his English version of the book entitled *The Islamic Guide to Developing ESQ Emotional Spiritual Quotient: Applying the ESQ way 165: 1 Value, 6 Principles and 5 Actions*.

⁷⁴ Syaikh Fadhalla Haeri, *Jelajah Diri: Panduan Psikologi Spiritual Membangun Kepribadian* (Jakarta: Serambi, 2004).

⁷⁵ Muhammad, *Ramadhan dan Pencerahan Spiritual* (Jakarta: Erlangga, 2005).

⁷⁶ Teguh Purwadi, *Online dengan Allah: 24 Jam Membangkitkan Kembali Spiritualitas Anda* (Bandung: Madania, 2007).

⁷⁷ Sallamah Muhammad Abu Al-Kamal, *Mukjizat Shalat Malam: Meraih Spiritualitas Rasulullah*, trans. I. Kurniawan (Bandung: Mizania, 2009). This is a translation from an Arabic book entitled *Qiyām al-Layl wa'l-Munāja 'inda al-Sabr*. The original title of the book does not use any Arabic word meaning 'spiritual', but in its translation into Indonesian, 'Spiritualitas' was added as part of its subtitle.

⁷⁸ Puji Hartono and Pranowo, *Spiritual Quantum Smile: Raih Sukses Dunia Akhirat dengan Senyum Dahsyat Memikat* (Yogyakarta: Pro-U, 2010).

⁷⁹ Donah Zohar, & Ian Marshall, *Spiritual Capital: Memberdayakan SQ di Dunia Bisnis*, trans. H. Mustofa, (Bandung: Mizan, 2005). The book is a translation work from Zohar's and Marshall's SQ, *Spiritual Intelligent, the Ultimate Intelligent*, which was first

Tradisi Keislamanan (Spiritual Education in Islamic Tradition) by Abudin Nata (2003),⁸⁰ *Gerakan Spiritual Syekh Siti Jenar* (Spiritual Movement of Syekh Siti Jenar) by Purwadi (2004),⁸¹ *Sains & Spiritualitas: Dari Nalar Fisika Hingga Bahasa Para Dewa* (Science and Spirituality: from the Logic of Physics to the Language of Gods) by Roy Budi Efferin (2006),⁸² *Spiritualitas Tanpa Tuhan* (Spirituality without God) by Andre Compte-Spoville (2007),⁸³ and *Perlindungan Lingkungan: Sebuah Perspektif dan Spiritualitas Islam* (Environmental Protection: A Perspective on Islamic Spirituality) by Sunardi (2008).⁸⁴

In addition to books in the above three categories, numerous publications of memoirs, biographies, and novels include the word ‘*spiritual*’ as part of the title or subtitle. This can be seen, for example, in *A Journey to Islam: Pengembaraan Spiritual Seorang Muslimah Australia* (Spiritual Journey of Australian Muslim Women) by Shifa Mustapha (2004),⁸⁵ *Catatan Spiritual di Balik Sosok Sobron Aidit* (Spiritual Notes behind the Figure of Sobron Aidit) by Sobron Aidit (2005),⁸⁶ *Kyai Multitalenta: Sebuah Oase Spiritual K.H. Tholbah Hasan* (Multi-talented Kyai: A Spiritual Oasis of K.H. Tholbah Hasan) by Nasaruddin Umar (2006),⁸⁷ and *Kasidab-kasidab Cinta: Novel Spiritual Keajaiban Cinta* (The Songs of Love: a Spiritual Novel

published in 2000. The Indonesian edition of the book is widely appreciated by the public in Indonesia. Almost all local writers on spirituality after 2001 used this book as their reference.

⁸⁰ Abudin Nata, *Pendidikan Spiritual dalam Tradisi Keislamanan* (Bandung: Angkasa, 2003).

⁸¹ Purwadi, *Gerakan Spiritual Syekh Siti Jenar* (Yogyakarta: Media Abadi, 2004).

⁸² Roy Budi Efferin, *Sains & Spiritualitas: dari Nalar Fisika hingga Bahasa Para Dewa* (Jakarta: One Earth Media, 2006).

⁸³ Andre Compte-Spoville, *Spiritualitas tanpa Tuhan*, trans. U. Tauhida (Jakarta: Alvabet, 2007).

⁸⁴ Sunardi, *Perlindungan, Lingkungan: Sebuah Perspektif dan Spiritualitas Islam* (Bandung: Program Studi Magister Ilmu Lingkungan, Universitas Padjadjaran, 2008).

⁸⁵ Shifa Mustapha, *A Journey to Islam: Pengembaraan Spiritual Seorang Muslimah Australia* (Bandung: Pustaka Bani Quraisy, 2004).

⁸⁶ Sobron Aidit, *Catatan Spiritual di Balik Sosok Sobron Aidit* (Jakarta: BPK Gunung Mulia, 2005).

⁸⁷ Nasaruddin Umar, *Kyai Multitalenta: Sebuah Oase Spiritual K.H. Tholbah Hasan* (Jakarta: Kerjasama Al-Ghazali Center dan PT. Lista Fariska Putra, 2006).

of the Miracle of Love) by Muhammad Muhyidin (2007).⁸⁸

Some of the above publications are translations, either from the English books (such as those written by Tony Buzan, Donah Zohar and Ian Marshal, Wayne W. Dyer, Rondha Byrne, and Andre Compte-Spoville), or from Arabic (like the works of Sallamah Muhammad Abu Al-Kamal and Syaikh Fadhallah Haeri). Interestingly, in the last two decades, there have been more English than Arabic publications on spirituality translated to Bahasa Indonesia. This fact underlines, as Hoesterey and Widodo have indicated, the increased acceptance, by middle class Indonesians, of Western literature on spirituality, New Age, popular psychology, self-help and ‘chicken soup for the soul.’⁸⁹

Some of the above publications deliberately put English words in their titles (such as ‘*Spiritual Management*’, ‘*Spiritual Intelligent*’, ‘*Spirituality@Work*’, ‘*Spiritual Side of Golf*’), although their contents are in Bahasa Indonesian. This ploy shows that the writers and the publishers want to attract more customers from the upper middle urban class, and shows that spirituality is in fashion for modern people.

It is also worth noting here the way current Indonesian publications ‘Islamize’ Western personal development books, or at least link them to religious considerations. Western spiritual publications rarely use the word God explicitly. For example, *The Secret*, by Rhonda Byrne (which is among international spiritual mind-management books which have sold well in Indonesia), uses the word ‘Universe’, with a capital U, instead of ‘God’, in explaining the *Law of Attraction*. When the book was cited in Indonesian publications, or used by personal development trainers in their spiritually oriented seminars and training programs, their translations changed the word ‘Universe’ (*Semesta*) to ‘God’ (*Tuhan*). This is interesting, since in the West, Christian writers criticize the books as being a danger to religion because they tend to encourage an atheistic point of view. People are directed by the book to rely on the power of mind instead of

⁸⁸ Muhammad Muhyidin, *Kasidah-kasidah Cinta: Novel Spiritual Keajaiban Cinta* (Jogjakarta: Diva Press, 2007).

⁸⁹ See Hoesterey, *Sufis and Self-help Gurus*; Amrih Widodo “Writing for God: Piety and Consumption in Popular Islam,” *Inside Indonesia*, 93 (Jul-Sep 2008); <http://www.insideindonesia.org/edition-93-j-ul-sep-2008/writing-for-god-14091121>; retrieved 14 September 2011.

the power of God, in order to achieve success.⁹⁰ In contrast, the book is appreciated in Indonesia as ‘Islamic’ and ‘religious.’ This is a clear example of the eclectic character of current Indonesian spiritual movements. The increased usage of ‘*spiritualitas*’ and ‘*spiritual*’ among Islamic publications in Indonesia indicates that Muslim scholars, as well as Muslim readers, are no longer averse to the words, even though they were not originally Arabic terms.

In contemporary daily usage, the words ‘*spiritual*’ and ‘*spiritualitas*’ may have various meanings, depending on their context and who is using them. In addition to referring to eclectic homegrown mystical traditions, inner dimensions of religion, and the psychological state of the human spirit, they may denote occult practices. ‘*Spiritualis*’ (literally meaning ‘person who masters spiritual techniques’)⁹¹ is used in terms of a person who has supernatural power, the paranormal. The *Posmo* tabloid, which is considered as a spiritual and paranormal tabloid, launched a yearly program called the ‘Posmo Award’ which is dedicated to the appreciation of *spiritualis*, paranormal and alternative healers, who have contributed much to its development and continuation. In 2005, the tabloid published a book entitled *Profil Spiritualis Penerima Posmo Award 2005* (Profiles of Spiritualists, Recipients of the 2005 Posmo Award). An examination of the list of the awardees shows that many of them are people who are considered masters of occultism, and are known as paranormals, magicians, and shamans (*dukun*).

There is also a group that employs the word ‘*spiritual*’ in contrast to ‘religious.’ In this group, organized religions are criticized. Because public criticism of religions would be socially and politically problematic and could potentially draw an accusation of religious blasphemy, such groups mostly operate via the Internet. An example of the group is the mailing list discussion forum of “*Spiritualitas Indonesia*.” In this group, religions are not only criticized but also derided. Since anyone can post his/her view on the Internet without restraint, we can find there, the opinions of various kinds of people, ranging from religious, to secular,

⁹⁰ Such a criticism is levelled, for example, by James Walker and Bob Waldrep, two apologetics experts who wrote a book entitled *The Truth behind the Secret*, as their response to the success of Rhonda Byrne’s *The Secret*.

⁹¹ Cf. the meaning of ‘spiritualist’ in *Webster’s English Dictionary* which is given as ‘someone who serves as an intermediary between the living and the dead’.

agnostic and atheist.

Among growth training centres that promote Spiritual Intelligent, 'spiritual' and 'spirituality' refer to the experiential dimension of religion. Spiritual training centres like the ESQ Way 165 of Ary Ginanjar, the Heart Intelligent (HI) of Synergy Leadership Centre, and the Bioenergi, explore their training material based on Islamic teaching and Sufism. When I asked the founders of the HI and the Bioenergi for clarification, they asserted that in their group the meaning of '*spiritual*' is the practical usage of Sufism. Nevertheless, although their spiritual teachings are based on Islamic tradition, they claim that their spiritual programs are universal, suitable for all people, regardless of religious and cultural background. It seems to me that the use of the term '*spiritual*' and '*spiritualitas*' in these groups is part of their strategy to broaden their potential customer base.

In the Bhakti Nusantara, the meaning of *spiritual*, as clarified by the group coordinator, is all things related to God that will lead people to God's way. In practice, the words '*spiritual*' and '*spiritualitas*' in the BN refer to the Sufi tradition of *dhiker* and the practice of *ziarah* (pilgrimage) to the scared tombs of *wali* (saint). The word '*spiritual*' in the BN also refers to the practice of contacting spirits of the saints, in order to access their exalted position as a means for getting closer to God.

Among Javanese spiritual movements like the Paguyuban Tri Tunggal, the word '*spiritual*' means 'a state of mentality that nurtures human identity.' According to Sapto, '*spiritual*' and '*spiritualitas*' are derived from a word 'spirit' meaning *semangat* or passion, vigour, of people. Then, for Sapto, "*Spiritualitas Jawa*" means a cultivation of three human elements, which are *cipta* (creative force, thought or idea), *rasa* (sense), and *karsa* (intention). Considering the relationship between Javanese identity on one hand, and religious identity on the other, Sapto said: "I do not want to lose my Java. It does not mean that if I already state my religion in the state ID, then I throw away my Javanese identity."⁹² Again, for Sapto, Java is the spirit of mental revival. Whenever people separate themselves from their spirit, they are no longer consistent.

In summary, the meanings of '*spiritual*' and '*spiritualitas*' in actual usage vary, depending on context. Their usage covers: (1) the religious

⁹² Interview with Sapto Raharjo, founder of the Paguyuban Tri Tunggal, 6 September 2009.

sphere, which equivalent to Sufism in Islam, (2) a mental state that nurtures human identity, (3) occultism and supernatural practices, and (4) devotional practices to the sacred, beyond organized religion.

D. Conclusion

To summarize the earlier discussion, I will draw the following conclusions: first, the historical fact of the problematic relationship between marginal spiritual expressions and the state and the official religions, as can be seen in the case of the *kebatinan* movements, does not hinder people from searching for new spiritual paths in contemporary Indonesia. A number of new spiritual channels have appeared, ranging from eclectic-local spiritual expressions and global spiritual movements operating in Indonesia, to the piety projects of urban sufi groups.

Second, the changing meaning of the word '*spiritual*' is apparent in the current spiritual publications in Indonesia, where proponents of the world religions are no longer averse to using the words '*spiritual*' and '*spiritualitas*.' This indicates a shift in the meaning of spirituality from the ideas and practices related to the indigenous and eclectic-cultural expressions outside official religions to one that is closely associated with religion. This also underlines that from time to time, in the Indonesian context, 'spirituality' and 'religion' are getting closer and are not in a totally oppositional relationship. This trend is a little bit different from what has happened in the West, where extra-ecclesiastical subjective-life spirituality has developed as a response to the aridity of life-as religion.⁹³ The growth of spiritual providers and the increasing number of people claiming to be '*spiritual*,' rather than belonging to a religion in the Western context, has raised the question as to whether spirituality has 'taken over' religion.⁹⁴ The adoption of words and ideas of the *spiritual* and *spiritualitas* among world religions in Indonesia has two possible meanings: (1) It indicates the eagerness of organized religions to frame the words in the context of religious teachings. Indonesia, then, seems to have a reverse trend, where religion has successfully 'taken over spirituality,' (2) Institutionalized religions which had excluded their experiential dimensions and practices tried to recover the experiential when they found an institutional form of

⁹³ Heelas, *The New Age Movement*; and Heelas & Woodhead, *The Spiritual Revolution*.

⁹⁴ Carrette & King, *Selling Spirituality*.

spirituality separate from religion. This means there is a contest between practitioners of life-as religions and the proponents of subjective-life spirituality, regarding spiritual authenticity.

Third, although Indonesia has its own trajectories in terms of the relationship between spirituality and religion, the development of Indonesian spiritual groups cannot be separated from the current global spiritual markets. The growth and influence of global spiritual markets, as can be seen from contemporary Indonesian spiritual publications, inspires the development of hybrid spiritual groups that blend local legacies with global ones.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Agustian, A. G., *Rahasia Sukses Membangun Kecerdasan Emosi dan Spiritual ESQ (Emotional Spiritual Quotient): Berdasarkan 6 Rukun Iman dan 5 Rukun Islam*, Jakarta: Arga, 2001.
- Aidit, S., *Catatan Spiritual di Balik Sosok Sobron Aidit*, Jakarta: BPK Gunung Mulia, 2005.
- Al-Kamal, S. M. A., *Mukjizat Shalat Malam: Meraih Spiritualitas Rasulullah*, trans. I. Kurniawan, Bandung: Mizania, 2009.
- Anderson, B., *Java in the Time of Revolution*, Ithaca-London: Cornell University Press, 1972.
- Artawijaya, *Gerakan Theosofi di Indonesia: Menelusuri Jejak Kebatiman Yabudi Sejak Masa Hindia Belanda Hingga Era Reformasi*, Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar, 2010.
- Buzan, Tony, *The Power of Spiritual Intelligence: Sepuluh Cara Jadi Orang yang Cerdas Secara Spiritual*, trans. A. T. Kanjono & F. Fialita, Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2003.
- Bruinessen, Martin van, "Saint, Politician and Sufi Bureaucrats: Mysticism and Politics in Indonesian's New Order," in Martin van Bruinessen & Julia D. Howell (eds), *Sufism and the 'Modern' in Islam*, New York: I.B. Tauris, 2007.
- Byrne, Rhonda, *The Secret*, Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2008.
- Carrette, Jeremy, & King, Richard, *Selling Spirituality, the Silent Takeover of Religion*, London-New York: Routledge, 2005.
- Compte-Spoville, A., *Spiritualitas Tanpa Tuhan*, trans. U. Tauhida, Jakarta: Alvabet, 2007.
- Danarto, *Gerak Gerik Allah: Sejumpt Hikmah Spiritual*, Surabaya: Risalah Gusti, 1996.
- Dawud, M. Isa, *Dialog dengan Jin Muslim: Pengalaman Spiritual*, trans. A. Muhammad, Bandung: Pustaka Hidayah, 1995.
- Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, *Pembinaan Organisasi dan Pelestarian Budaya Spiritual*, Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 1985.
- , *Pengkajian Nilai-nilai Lubur Budaya Spiritual Bangsa Daerah Istimewa*

- Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta: Kantor Wilayah Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan DIY, 1990.
- , *Naskah Pemaparan Budaya Spiritual Yayasan Sosrokartono*, Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan R.I., 1991.
- , *Budaya Spiritual dalam Situs Keramat di Gunung Kawi, Jawa Timur*. Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan R.I., 1994.
- Dyer, Wayne. W., *There is Spiritual Solution to Every Problem*, Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2005.
- Efferin, R. B., *Sains & Spiritualitas: dari Nalar Fisika hingga Babasa Para Dewa*, Jakarta: One Earth Media, 2006.
- ESQ LC., "About Us," *Your Partner in Character Building*, <http://www.esqway165.com/id/about-us/>; retrieved 10 September, 2011.
- Farrer, D. S., "Shadows of the Prophet Martial Arts and Sufi Mysticism," *Muslims in Global Societies Series*, 1, 2, 2009.
- Federspiel, Howard. M., *A Dictionary of Indonesian Islam*, Athens-Ohio: Ohio University, Center for International Studies, 1995.
- Ghani, M. A., *The Spirituality in Business: Pencerahan Hati Bagi Pelaku Usaha*, Jakarta: Pena Budi Aksara, 2005.
- Gilbert, R. A., "Occultism," *Britannica Academic Edition*; <http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/424235/occultism>; retrieved 10 March, 2011.
- Gobe, E., & Andrianse, C., *Nasihat-nasihat C. Snouck Hurgonje Semasa Kepegawaiannya pada Pemerintah Hindia Belanda 1889-1936*, trans. Sukarsi, Jakarta: INIS, 1992.
- Grand Lodge of British and Yukon, *Annie Wood Besant*; http://freemasonry.bcy.ca/biography/esoterica/besant_a/besant_a.html; retrieved 5 December, 2011.
- Griffin, D. R., *Visi-visi Postmodern: Spiritualitas dan Masyarakat*, trans. A. G. Admiranto, Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 1988.
- Hadiwiyono, Harun, *Man in the Present Javanese Mysticism*, Baarn, Netherlands: Bosch & Keuning, 1967.
- Haeri, Shaikh, F., *Jelajah Diri: Panduan Psikologi Spiritual Membangun Kepribadian*, Jakarta: Serambi, 2004.

- Hakim, Lukman & Wikayanto, *Spiritual Based Management : Memimpin dan Bekerja Berbasis Spiritual*, Jakarta: Hikmah, 2007.
- Hamka, *Perkembangan Kebatinan di Indonesia*, Djakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1971.
- Hartono, Puji & Pranowo, *Spiritual Quantum Smile: Raib Sukses Dunia Akhirat dengan Senyum Dahsyat Memikat*, Yogyakarta: Pro-U, 2010.
- Heelas, Paul, *The New Age Movement: The Celebration of the Self and the Sacralization of Modernity*, Oxford-Cambridge, Massasuchet: Blackwell, 1996.
- & Linda Woodhead, *The Spiritual Revolution: Why Religion is Giving Way to Spirituality*, Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Pub., 2005.
- Hoesterey, J. B., "Marketing Morality: the Rise, Fall and Rebranding of Aa Gym," in Greg Fealy & Sally White (eds), *Expressing Islam: Religious Life and Politics in Indonesia*, Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2008.
- , "Sufis and Self-help Gurus: Islamic Psychology, Religious Authority, and Muslim Subjectivity in Contemporary Indonesia," *PhD Dissertation*, The University of Wisconsin, Wisconsin, 2009.
- Howe, D. G., "Sumarah: A study of the Art of Living," *PhD Thesis*, University Microfilms International, University of North Carolina, 1980.
- Howell, Julia. D., "Vehicles for the Kalki Avatar: The Experiments of a Javanese Guru in Rationalizing Ecstatic Religion," *PhD Dissertation*, Stanford University, 1976.
- , "Indonesia: Searching for Concensus," in C. Cardarola (ed.), *Religion and Societies: Asia and the Middle East*, Berlin: Mouton Publisher, 1982.
- , "Kebatinan," in James. J. Fox (ed.), *Indonesian Heritage: Religion and Ritual*, Singapore: Archipelago Press, 1998.
- , "Sufism and the Indonesian Islamic Revival," *The Journal of Asian Studies*, vol. 60, no. 3, August 2001.
- , 'Spirituality' vs. 'Religion' Indonesian Style: Framing and Re-framing Experiential Religiosity in Contemporary Indonesian Islam," *Paper* presented at the the 15th Biennial Conference of the Asian Studies Association of Australia, Canberra, ACT, 2004. <http://coombs.anu.edu.au/SpecialProj/ASAA/biennial-conference/2004/Howell-J>

ASAA2004.pdf.

- , "The New Spiritualities, East and West: Colonial Legacies and the Global Spiritual Marketplace in Southeast Asia," *ASSR*, 19(1) 2006.
- , "Modernity and Islamic Spirituality in Indonesia's New Sufi Networks," in Martin van Bruinessen & Julia D. Howell (eds), *Sufism and the 'Modern' in Islam*, New York: IB Tauris, 2007.
- , "Disenchantment, Re-enchantment and the Globalized Politics of Religion in Southeast Asian Islam," *Paper* presented at the STS 48: Spirituality vs. Religion in Global Context, ISSR/SISR Conference, Leipzig, 2007b.
- , "Modulations of Active Piety: Professors and Televangelists as Promoters of Indonesian "Sufisme,"" in Greg Fealy & Sally White (eds), *Expressing Islam Religious Life and Politics in Indonesia*, Singapore: ISEAS, 2008.
- , "Indonesia's Salafis Sufi," *Modern Asia Studies*, 44, 2010, 1029-1051.
- Ilyas, U., "SK Trimurti: Pejuang Pembebasan Nasional," *Berdikari Online*; <http://berdikarionline.com/opini/20100916/sk-trimurti-wartawati-pejuang-pembebasan-nasional.html>; retrieved September 16, 2010.
- Jacobs, Tom, *Theologi dan Spiritualitas*, Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 1994.
- Jaya, T. P., *Penipuan Berkedok Spiritual: Waspada Trik dan Sibir*, Solo: Aneka, 1999.
- Jensen, J. S., & Leopold, A. M., *Syncretism in Religion: A Reader*, London: Equinox, 2004.
- Kartodirjo, Sartono, "Religious Movements of Java in 19th and 20th Centuries," in Sartono Kartodirjo (ed.), *Profiles of Malay Culture*, Jakarta: Ministry of Education and Culture, Directorate General of Culture, 1976.
- , *Laporan-laporan tentang Gerakan Protest di Jawa pada Abad XX*, trans. S. Kartodirjo, Jakarta: Arsip Nasional Indonesia, 1981.
- Martokoesoema, P. H., *Spiritual Thinking: Sukses dengan Neuro Linguistic Programming (NLP) dan Tasawuf*, Bandung: Mizan Pustaka, 2007.
- Masruri, *Sukses Profesi Spiritual: Etika Konsultasi yang Bermibawa*, Solo: Aneka, 1999.

- Melton, G., J. (ed.), *Encyclopedia of Occultism & Parapsychology A compedium of Information on the Occult Science, Magic, Demonology, Supersition, Spiritism, Mysticism, Metaphusics, Psycal Science, and Parapsychology*, Detroit: Gale Group, 2001.
- Muhammad, *Ramadhan dan Pencerahan Spiritual*, Jakarta: Erlangga, 2005.
- Muhyidin, M., *Kasidab-kasidab Cinta: Novel Spiritual Keajaiban Cinta*, Yogyakarta: Diva Press, 2007.
- Mulder, Niels, *Mysticism & Everyday Life in Contemporary Java: Cultural Persistence and Change*, Singapore: Singapore University Press, 1978.
- Mustapha, S., *A Journey to Islam: Pengembaraan Spiritual Seorang Muslimah Australia*, Bandung: Pustaka Bani Quraisy, 2004.
- Nasr, Sayyed Hossein, *Spiritualitas Islam: Ensiklopedia Tematis*, Bandung: Mizan, 1985.
- , *Spiritualitas dan Seni Islam*, Bandung: Mizan, 1987.
- Nata, Abudin, *Pendidikan Spiritual dalam Tradisi Keislaman*, Bandung: Angkasa, 2003.
- Nitimihardjo, H., *Kutemukan Tuhan di Balik Penyakit Gagal Ginjal: Otobiografi Spiritual Handjojo Nitimihardjo*, Jakarta: Pustaka Antara Utama, 1998.
- Nugraha, I. P., *Mengikis Batas Timur dan Barat: Gerakan Theosofi & Nasionalisme Indonesia*, Jakarta: Komunitas Bambu, 2001.
- Nur'aeni, Z., "The Phenomenon of Abdullah Gymnastiar and Darut Tauhid: A Notion of Pietization," *Paper presented at the Graduate Workshop on Piety and Pietization in Asia*, Asia Research Institute, NUS, Singapore, 2007.
- Partadiredja, Ace, *Al Qur'an: Mu'jizat, Karomat, Maunat dan Hukum Evolusi Spiritual*, Yogyakarta: Dana Bhakti Prima Yasa, 1997.
- Pierce, G. F. A., *Spirituality@Work: 10 Cara Menyeimbangkan Hidup Anda di Tempat Kerja*, Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 2006.
- Pratomo, E., *Membangun Kecerdasan Finansial dengan Nilai-nilai Spiritualitas*, Jakarta: Arga Publishing, 2008.
- Purwadi, *Gerakan Spiritual Syekh Siti Jenar*, Yogyakarta: Media Abadi, 2004.
- Purwadi, et al. (eds), *Jejak Para Wali dan Ziarah Spiritual*, Jakarta: Kompas, 2006.

- Purwadi, T., *Online dengan Allah: 24 Jam Membangkitkan Kembali Spiritualitas Anda*, Bandung: Madania, 2007.
- Rasjidi, M., *Islam dan Kebatinan*, Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1974.
- Ricklefs, M. C., *A History of Modern Indonesia Since c. 1200*, Hampshire: Palgrave, 2001.
- , *Mystic Synthesis in Java: A History of Islamization from the Fourteenth to the early Nineteenth Centuries*, Nortwalk: Signature Books, 2006.
- , *Polarizing Javanese Society: Islamic, and Other Visions, 1830-1930*, Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2007.
- Rudnyckyj, Daromir, "Market Islam in Indonesia," *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute (NS)*, 2009.
- , "Spiritual Economies: Islam dan Neoliberalism in Contemporary Indonesia," *Cultural Anthropology*, 24(1), 2009.
- Simuh, "Gerakan Protes dalam Islam di Indonesia," *Paper* presented at the Panel Diskusi Analisis Kristis Berkembangnya Gerakan Sempalan di Kalangan Umat Islam Indonesia, Jakarta, 1989.
- Solahudin, D., *The Workshop for Morality: The Islamic Creativity of Pesantren Darut Taubid in Bandung, Java*, Canberra: ANU E-Press, 2008.
- Stange, Paul D. "'Legitimate' Mysticism in Indonesia," *Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs*, 2 (Summer), 1986.
- Subagya, Rachmat, *Kepercayaan Kebatinan Kerohanian Kejawaaan dan Agama*, Yogyakarta: Yayasan Kanisius, 1976.
- , *Agama Asli Indonesia*, Jakarta: Sinar Harapan, 1981.
- Sunardi, *Perlindungan Lingkungan: Sebuah Perspektif dan Spiritualitas Islam*, Bandung: Program Studi Magister Ilmu Lingkungan, Universitas Padjadjaran, 2008.
- Tanja, Victor I., *Spiritualitas Pluralitas dan Pembangunan Indonesia*, Jakarta: Gunung Mulia, 1994.
- Tim Penyusun Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia, *Kamus Bahasa Indonesia*, Jakarta: Pusat Bahasa, 2008.
- Tollenaere, H. A. O. D., *The Politic of Divine Wisdom, Theosophy and Labour, National, and Women Movements in Indonesia and South Asia 1875-1947*, Leiden: Uitgeveij Katholieke Universiteit Nijmegen, 1996.

- Umar, Nasarudin, *Kyai Multitalenta: Sebuah Oase Spiritual K.H. Tholhab Hasan*, Jakarta: Kerjasama Al-Ghazali Center dan PT. Lista Fariska Putra, 2006.
- Usman, G., "Studi Banding Pengaruh Pengajian Tasawuf dan Dzikir Terhadap Rakyat Banjar dalam Usaha Menghadapi Kolonialisme Belanda," *paper* Seminar Sejarah Nasional IV di Yogyakarta 16-19 Desember 1985. Yogyakarta: Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, Direktorat Sejarah dan Nilai Tradisional, Proyek Inventarisasi dan Dokumentasi Sejarah Nasional, Jakarta, 1985.
- Walker, J. K., & Waldrep B., *The Truth Behind The Secret: A Reasoned Response to the Runaway Bestseller*, Eugene, Or.: Harvest House Publishers, 2007.
- Webster's Online Dictionary, "Spirituality," in *Webster's Online Dictionary*; <http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/definitions/spirituality?cx=partner-pub-0939450753529744%3Av0qd01-tdlq&cof=FORID%3A9&ie=UTF-8&q=spirituality&sa=Search#922>; retrieved 15 May, 2011.
- Widodo, Amrih, "Writing for God: Piety and Consumption in Popular Islam," *Inside Indonesia*, 93 (Jul-Sep 2008); <http://www.insideindonesia.org/edition-93-j-ul-sep-2008/writing-for-god-14091121>.
- Zamhari, Arif, *Rituals of Islamic Spirituality: A Study of Majelis Dhikr Groups in East Java*, Canberra: ANU-Press, 2010.
- Zohar, Donah & Marshal, Ian, *SQ, Memanfaatkan Kecerdasan Spiritual dalam Berfikir Integralistik dan Holistik untuk Memaknai Kehidupan* trans. R. Astuti, A. N. Burhani & A. Baiquni, Bandung: Mizan, 2001.
- , *Spiritual Capital: Memberdayakan SQ di Dunia Bisnis*, trans. H. Mustofa, Bandung: Mizan, 2005.